

TENDRING DISTRICT COUNCIL'S PROTOCOL FOR CABINET AND OVERVIEW & SCRUTINY ROLES

1. Introduction

- 1.1 The counterpart to operating Cabinet arrangements within a Council is the provision of Overview & Scrutiny functions. You cannot have Cabinet arrangements without its counterpart.
- 1.2 Overview & Scrutiny has the following powers in law:
 - (a) to scrutinise any decision made by the Cabinet,
 - (b) to make recommendations to the Council/Cabinet with respect to functions/responsibility of the Cabinet,
 - (c) to scrutinise decisions made by non-executive functions of the Council
 - (d) to make recommendations to the Council/Cabinet with respect to the non-executive functions/responsibilities,
 - (e) to make recommendations to the Council/Cabinet on matters which affect the Council's area or the those living there.
- 1.3 The Council's Constitution sets out how those powers are to be managed and the standards Members and Officers will adhere to. The purpose of this Protocol is not to repeat the Constitutional Articles, Rules and Procedures but to focus on how the relationship between the roles of Cabinet and Overview & Scrutiny will be exercised.
- 1.4 Officers must act with political impartiality, serving the whole council rather than particular groups or members; as such they serve the Members of the Cabinet and of the Overview & Scrutiny Committees equally.
- 1.5 In operating its Overview & Scrutiny functions, the Council will have regard to the statutory guidance for this function. This Protocol is one of the measures the Council has adopted to address the following statement in the statutory guidance:

"Effective scrutiny involves looking at issues that can be politically contentious. It is therefore inevitable that, at times, an executive will disagree with the findings or recommendations of a scrutiny committee."

2. Application of the Protocol

- 2.1 In utilising its powers in 1.2, Overview & Scrutiny will act as a 'critical friend' to the Leader and Cabinet.
- 2.2 This Protocol applies to all members of Overview & Scrutiny Committees, any Member who may sit on a Scrutiny Task and Finish Group, the Leader of the Council and all Members of the Cabinet.
- 2.3 All Members will promote the legitimate role of Overview & Scrutiny as outlined in 1.2 above.
- 2.4 All Members must have regard to the Corporate Plan adopted by Council and its capacity and resources to deliver services efficiently, effectively, to achieve value for money and outcomes. Overview & Scrutiny Committees will be mindful of this in its work planning.

3. Trust

- 3.1 All Members should promote an atmosphere of openness at Overview & Scrutiny Committee meetings and should strive to ensure that questioning and debate takes place within a climate of mutual respect and trust.

- 3.2 Overview & Scrutiny Members need to trust that Cabinet Members are being open, honest and fulsome when participating in the enquiries being undertaken.
- 3.3 Cabinet Members need to trust Overview & Scrutiny Members with information and to trust in their views.
- 3.4 While Members on the Overview & Scrutiny Committees will come from different political groups including those not aligned with a registered political party, the public must trust that they will act with an independence in determining the work programme of the Committees and in undertaking enquiries identified in the work programmes.

4. Policy Development and Pre-Decision Scrutiny

- 4.1 The value of early input from Overview & Scrutiny into policy development is recognised. Through early consultation, Overview & Scrutiny can act as a sounding board and a think tank in enquiring into issues coming up on the horizon, bringing in added value. The Leader and Cabinet Members (as well as Officers) will draw to the attention of the relevant Overview & Scrutiny committee, policies and strategies that are being developed or are due for review to enable Overview & Scrutiny to build this into their work programme and thereby have a timely input.
- 4.2 All policy development will be carried out in a way to promote inclusive dialogue and to capture views of Members' with a report submitted to the relevant Overview & Scrutiny Committee for consideration by the appropriate Member of Cabinet. The Cabinet and relevant (Assistant) Director will consider the views of Overview & Scrutiny members in the development of the policy and provide a response to the Overview & Scrutiny Committee on the recommendations. The detail of the Overview & Scrutiny involvement shall also be included within the body of the report to Cabinet. The Cabinet/Full Council will continue to be responsible for approving and adopting policy whether this accepts all, some or none of the recommendations from Overview & Scrutiny.
- 4.3 Cabinet Members may wish to request views from Overview & Scrutiny Members on an individual decision before it is taken. The Cabinet Member will be responsible for circulating the details to the relevant Committee Members, through the designated Scrutiny Officer. Utilising this as an option does not exclude the decision from being subject to call-in, however, it will give the Cabinet Member the ability to consider different views and perspectives of a decision to be taken before it is taken.
- 4.4 Like all parts of the Council, Overview & Scrutiny only has a certain capacity and cannot scrutinise everything. It is for Overview & Scrutiny to determine its work programme, in an informed way, and the views of Cabinet are always welcome. Just as Cabinet is not required to accept all recommendations from Overview & Scrutiny on enquiries undertaken, Overview & Scrutiny is not required to accept recommendations from Cabinet concerning the work programme of the Committee. Both should actively consider the other's recommendations and set out reasons for its decision. Both share the ambition of quality public services for residents in, businesses of and visitors to the Council's area.

5. Holding the Cabinet to Account

5.1 A key role of Overview & Scrutiny is in holding the Cabinet to account for decisions taken and performance of services. In holding the Cabinet to account Overview & Scrutiny Members will:

- Consider decisions taken by the Cabinet, individually and collectively and items on the Notice of Forthcoming Decisions through formal Overview & Scrutiny Committee meetings;
- Review service performance and performance against policy and targets;
- Respect the 'safe space' required by Cabinet Members and senior officers to think freely and offer frank advice to each other (and to receive the same) as they formulate substantial changes to services, responses to important pressing issues or pursue intense negotiations to resolve disputes.
- Be prepared to ask searching questions that provide a constructive challenge for the purposes of undertaking the Overview & Scrutiny function and not solely for individual information gathering purposes;
- Be positive and respectful in their interactions with Cabinet Members. This will include being clear whether the Cabinet Member is specifically invited, sending invitations in a timely way, acknowledging the attendance of the Cabinet Member at the meeting and allowing the Cabinet Member to address the Committee and respond to questions;
- Respond positively to a Cabinet Member if that Member wishes to attend a particular meeting for a given item and they have not been formally invited to confirm whether an invitation is to be extended to them to attend.
- Represent (and amplify) the voices of the public;
- Listen to the responses provided and to assist the Cabinet in identifying areas for further consideration and improvement, where necessary;
- Recognise that not all reviews require recommendations back to Cabinet, if the Overview & Scrutiny Committee were satisfied with the subject matter under consideration

5.2 In return, Cabinet Members will:

- Be willing to be open, honest and engaged in providing responses to constructive challenge and, where 'safe space' to give/receive frank advice is required, what time frame that will be needed for that 'safe space', subject to resources and Officers time;
- Value the importance of Overview & Scrutiny;
- Be supportive of the Overview & Scrutiny process and invite and seek opinion from Overview & Scrutiny Members on decisions to be taken, where appropriate;
- Provide a positive contribution to scrutiny meetings;
- Attend meetings when invited to do so to answer questions and present information:
 - ✓ By way of a direct answer
 - ✓ By reference to published publications
 - ✓ By referring a matter to an officer in attendance, if they are not able to respond

- ✓ If an answer cannot immediately be given, by providing a written answer within five working days unless it is not reasonable to do so. If considered unreasonable, an explanation as to why will be given.
 - ✓ A combination of the above options.
 - Depart the Overview & Scrutiny Committee meeting when that Committee expresses a wish to deliberate on a matter after hearing from the Cabinet Member.
- 5.3 Continuing dialogue should underpin Overview & Scrutiny enquiries. As such, pre-meetings (or other communication) between Cabinet Members and the Overview & Scrutiny Committee Chairman is encouraged about a forthcoming enquiry. Where possible, Overview & Scrutiny Committee Members will be encouraged to pass questions on the subject of the enquiry to the Cabinet Member/relevant Officer or outside representative in advance of a Committee meeting. As identified elsewhere, after the meeting and where recommendations are made to the Cabinet there should be a discussion between the Cabinet Member and the Chairman of the Overview & Scrutiny Committee.
- 5.4 The purpose of any pre-meeting (or other communication) referred to above involving a Cabinet Member is not to replace consideration of any agenda item at the published formal meeting, as it is only this setting which the formal business of the Committee can be undertaken.

6. Budget setting and monitoring - The importance of scrutiny

- 6.1 Budget scrutiny must also be carried out on a rolling programme. Quarterly throughout the year proactive scrutiny assists to inform the next financial year's budget and long term forecast, work can involve:
- Challenging how the budget has been constructed before it is agreed. In particular, probing any assumptions that lie behind the executive's budget strategy, i.e. is the approach incremental or is it starting from a base budget, what are the main savings proposals, how will any growth be funded, are the financial implications of proposals from departments or committees built into the overall budget and has an appropriate level of reserves been set?
 - Carrying out budget monitoring activity, for example in areas where expenditure against budget looks to be well above or below forecasts and where growth/savings targets and revised forecasts are involved.
 - Undertaking some evaluation of performance and value for money including how it aligns to the Council's Corporate Plan and Priorities.
 - Maintaining a 'big picture' view of the financial pressures affecting the council and continuously challenging how these might impact on existing budgets and budget setting in subsequent years.
- 6.2 It is important to ensure that this work is undertaken throughout the year and not left until the last Budget Report to Overview and Scrutiny Committee, which is for the final consultation purposes prior to Cabinet's recommendations to Full Council. There is insufficient time to properly respond to the proposals or matters raised, due to the statutory timetable to set a budget. The Overview & Scrutiny function in this important process must be timely and add value, at the point Cabinet recommends its detailed budget proposals including the setting

the level of Council Tax increase, the comments received from Overview and Scrutiny during the year will be regarded. The Council's Budget & Policy Framework Procedure Rules sets out the Process for Developing the Budget.

7. Performance Measurement and Reporting

- 7.1 Measures of performance provide insight into whether value is being achieved and whether improvements are necessary, feasible and affordable. An open sharing of performance data will take place across the Council; including between Cabinet and Overview & Scrutiny. The purpose of reporting general performance data to the Overview & Scrutiny Committee is so that it can undertake scrutiny of it in so far as:
- (a) Is the performance monitoring system capturing the right level of data to support delivery of services – and to make recommendations thereon; and
 - (b) Is there performance as identified in the monitoring data that warrants further enquiry of an activity – and to determine whether and how that enquiry should take place; including it as appropriate in the work programme for that enquiry.
- 7.2 When enquiring into an individual service or subject, Overview & Scrutiny Committee Members will consider the performance measurements available. They will naturally assess whether this aligns with your own research; particularly the experience of service-users.
- 7.3 When considering the performance against the Cabinet's approved annual priority list of actions against the Corporate Plan Themes, Overview & Scrutiny will not normally seek to use the process to question that approved list of actions during the year. There are other Council procedures that can and should be used if there is a compelling need to review those actions. Overview & Scrutiny may legitimately have a view on what the annual priority list of actions should be the following year and these can be set out in recommendations to Cabinet.
- 7.4 Where a service of the Council is being delivered by a third party/outside company or where the matter under enquiry is the responsibility of a partner organisation, they will be encouraged to respond to enquiries from Overview & Scrutiny Committees relevant to the service/enquiry. This will include their own performance data.

8. The Inter-relationship between Cabinet, Audit and Overview & Scrutiny

- 8.1 It is important that Cabinet receives clear advice within the respective responsibilities of the Overview & Scrutiny Committees and the Audit Committee. It is therefore equally important that the formal audit role of the Audit Committee is left to that Committee. Areas in which financial scrutiny can add value, complementary to the work of the Audit Committee, including the following according to the Local Government Association:
- Reviewing draft (medium-term) financial plans
 - Monitoring internal and external audit reports, in order to identify areas where further scrutiny may be beneficial

- Responding to requests from the public for greater clarity on the council's finance and spending plans
 - Periodically carrying out post-implementation reviews of large (in terms of revenue or capital) projects
 - Challenging decisions related to new service commitments, investments, and previously unbudgeted demands
 - Scrutinising the financial implications of greater partnership working
 - Keeping a regular 'watching brief' on important matters affecting general resource management.
- 8.2 The above matters will inform the work planning of Overview & Scrutiny of Council functions and those of partners.
- 8.3 Cabinet, Audit and Overview & Scrutiny Committees will be guided by advice from the Council's Section 151 Officer on the boundary of responsibility between Audit and Overview & Scrutiny.

9. Overview & Scrutiny Work planning

- 9.1 Around the start of each Municipal Year, the Overview & Scrutiny committees will hold a work planning workshop. As part of this workshop the views of the relevant Cabinet Member(s) will be inputted alongside the views received from others. The Cabinet's adopted priorities in support of the Corporate Plan will be considered, areas of planned policy development over the relevant Municipal Year (and the next) will be provided and they will be asked to highlight any areas where overview & scrutiny may be specifically invited to assist in work (including Community Leadership areas).
- 9.2 The Chairmen and Vice-Chairmen of the Overview & Scrutiny Committees will meet quarterly with representatives of the Cabinet in order to ensure ongoing opportunities for Cabinet input into Overview & Scrutiny Committee work plans, ongoing opportunities for Overview & Scrutiny to input into Cabinet policy development or to address performance issues and to build on the positive working relationship between the two functions.
- 9.3 Overview & Scrutiny Committees may legitimately expect to receive a written report with relevant details for each item on its work programme and, where possible, this report should always be circulated with the agenda for the meeting.

10. Overview & Scrutiny Recommendations to the Cabinet

- 10.1 Overview & Scrutiny Committees may make recommendations to the Cabinet on functions the Council is responsible for through a formal committee meeting or, say, by way of a Task & Finish Group's Final Report.
- 10.2 Upon receipt of a recommendation from Overview & Scrutiny, Cabinet Members will:
- Give due consideration to any recommendations or views expressed;
 - Provide an explanation for the reasons why recommendations made by Overview & Scrutiny have or have not been pursued.
- 10.3 Once approved by the relevant Overview & Scrutiny Committee, the views of the Cabinet Member on any recommendations will be sought and included within the report. The Chairman of the Overview & Scrutiny Committee/Task & Finish Group will have the opportunity to meet with the relevant Cabinet

Member(s) to discuss the recommendations and the response to those recommendations. The Final Report will then be submitted to the Cabinet for consideration. Should any of the recommendations not be approved or be only partially supported, the Cabinet will provide details of the reason why. The response of Cabinet to recommendations will be reported to the next available meeting of the Overview & Scrutiny Committee.

11. Urgent Items of Cabinet Business

- 11.1 The Chairman of the appropriate Overview and Scrutiny Committee may be requested to consent to certain decision being taken by the Cabinet/a Cabinet Member if there is an urgent decision needing to be taken and, due to that urgency, the required notice cannot be given and/or the normal call-in procedures of a decision cannot be applied. The Committee Chairman will consider each request and will not unreasonably withhold consent where the purpose of granting consent is in accordance with the legislative provisions and thereby permit the urgent decision to be made. Notice of the urgency reasons and the consent of the Committee Chairman will then follow.

12. Scrutiny Consideration of Confidential Decisions

- 12.1 Overview & Scrutiny Committee Members have a right to access exempt information supporting decisions that have been taken in order to allow an effective enquiry of the decision. Should an Overview & Scrutiny Member wish to ask questions at a public Committee meeting around an decision that itself is exempt from publication or is based on information that is so exempt, the press and public may be excluded in accordance with the Council's Constitution and the Cabinet Member will be expected to answer in an open and transparent manner. The exempt information will remain confidential and all elected members and officers who receive that information shall maintain that confidentiality in line with the codes of conduct for Elected Members and Officers.

13. Call-in

- 13.1 Following the mediation process provided for in the Constitution, and on the basis of a continuing call-in situation, Cabinet Members will be expected to attend any meetings of Overview & Scrutiny committees at which a call-in request in relation to their area of responsibility is being considered. Summarising the requirements of the relevant Procedure Rules in the Constitution, if the relevant Cabinet Member cannot attend, the Leader, should attend in their absence or designate another Cabinet Member to do so. The purpose of their attendance will be to present the decision and the basis for it and to answer questions of fact. The following procedure will take place where call-ins are being considered:
- i. One of the Members who called in the decision will speak first.
 - ii. The Chair will invite the Cabinet Member (decision maker) to respond.
 - iii. The Committee will then ask questions of the decision maker, who may ask a relevant officer to supply further information if necessary.
 - iv. The Committee debates the issue and votes on the outcome.

14. Councillor Call to Action

- 14.1 Cabinet Members will be invited and expected to attend any meetings of Overview & Scrutiny Committees at which a call to action request in relation to their area of responsibility is being considered. A similar process will apply as outlined for Call-In decisions referred to earlier.
- 14.2 Overview & Scrutiny Committee members are not entitled to draft materials while policy is being developed unless the Cabinet consults the relevant Overview and Resources Committee through the formulation of policy. This is to ensure resources are used in an efficient manner. Cabinet Members and Officers are expected to ensure the Schedule of Forthcoming Decisions is up to date and accurate to assist with this for work programming purposes.

15. Ensuring Compliance with the Protocol

- 15.1 The Head of Democratic Services & Elections (in his role as the designated Scrutiny Officer) and the Assistant Director of Governance (in their role as Monitoring Officer) will be responsible for overseeing compliance with the Cabinet/Overview & Scrutiny Protocol which should be used by Members to support the wider aim of supporting and promoting a culture of overview & scrutiny. The success of the protocol will be determined by:
- Recognition of the value of overview & scrutiny;
 - A clear record of constructive challenge;
 - Valuable Overview & Scrutiny reviews that achieve outcomes;
 - An open and accountable decision making process.
- 15.2 With due regard to the Council's Statement on Council development, training will be made available for those on Overview & Scrutiny Committees and those in the Cabinet on this protocol and elements referenced in it including work planning, budget scrutiny, using performance data and key lines of enquiry.
- 15.3 In the Overview & Scrutiny Annual Report submitted to Full Council each year there will be a section demonstrating the impact of Overview & Scrutiny and effectiveness of the Protocol.
- 15.4 All Members have agreed to adhere to the Council's Policies and Procedures through the Members' Code of Conduct. Any Member who considers the principles of this Protocol had been compromised will raise the issue with the Leader or relevant Chairman of the Overview & Scrutiny to seek resolution in the first instance. Where appropriate, the Group Leader will be notified. In circumstances, where a suitable resolution has not been reached between Members, the matter can be raised with the Monitoring Officer.
- 15.5 Any concerns regarding the behaviours between Members and Officers will be dealt with in accordance with the Member Officer Relationship Protocol.